

**Report of Assistant Chief Executive, Community Access and Performance**

**Report to the Outer East Area Committee**

**Date: 13 December 2011**

**Subject: Leeds Citizens Panel in Support of Locality Working**

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| Are specific electoral Wards affected?  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| If relevant, name(s) of Ward(s):<br>All wards are affected                      |   |  |
| Are there implications for equality and diversity and cohesion and integration? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No            |
| Is the decision eligible for Call-In?   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Does the report contain confidential or exempt information?                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| If relevant, Access to Information Procedure Rule number:<br>Appendix number:   |   |  |

**Summary of main issues**

Financial pressures, localism and the council values all highlight the importance of consulting residents about what we do and where they live, in high quality, cost-effective and representative ways.

There is a need to improve the coordination and consistency of consultation in Leeds, and to do so as efficiently as possible. The current approach to managing consultation includes the ad hoc use of an existing Citizens' Panel which is no longer fit for purpose.

This paper outlines the progress being made to create a new Panel of 6000 residents who would be representative of population profiles at Area Committee level. It sets out how the new Leeds Citizens' Panel will be developed and managed and seeks the Area Committees views on the opportunities it presents for supporting local decision making.

## **Recommendations**

The Outer East Area Committee is asked to:

- Note and comment on the development of a new Citizen's Panel in Leeds as described in this paper
- Support the use of the new Leeds Citizens' Panel and to take up its use as part of the committee's community engagement activities in support of Wellbeing fund priority setting and in the development of the Area Business Plans.

### **1.0 Purpose of this report**

- 1.1 To outline the progress being made to create and manage a new and enlarged Leeds Citizens' Panel that will form an important tool for the council and partners' consultation activity.
- 1.2 To present the advantages of the new Panel in terms of efficiency, partnership working and supporting localised consultation of communities of place and interest.
- 1.3 To update the committee on the progress towards launching the new Leeds Citizens' Panel.
- 1.4 To consider the opportunities that the Leeds Citizens Panel offers for undertaking consultation at the Area Committee level to identify Wellbeing fund priorities and the support the development of the Area Business Plans.

### **2.0 Background information**

- 2.1 The development of the Leeds Citizens' Panel is part of a wider plan to improve the way we undertake community engagement in the council. This plan looks at improvements in a context of limited resources and the council values 'working with communities' and 'spending money wisely'.
- 2.2 Financial pressures, localism and new council values all highlight the importance of consulting residents about what we do and where they live, in high quality, cost-effective and representative ways.
- 2.3 A citizens' panel is a representative database of residents willing to take part in regular consultation activity over a period of time. Panels are recruited to be representative of wider populations by characteristics such as age, gender, ethnicity and disability.
- 2.4 A panel of approximately 1000 active members is currently available to Leeds City Council, although the membership has not been refreshed for several years and key communities are now poorly represented. At present, use is ad-hoc and response rates have declined significantly over time through lack of contact or refreshment of the membership.
- 2.5 A pilot to use the current Leeds Citizens' Panel on a locality basis took place in 2010. Panel members living in one specific area of the city were consulted on

community safety and environmental issues. Surveying was primarily undertaken online using Talking Point to reduce costs.

- 2.6 While the pilot demonstrated that consulting the Panel on local issues can achieve a high response rate (74% in the case of the pilot) and very low costs compared to past paper-based consultation, it highlighted that the current Panel membership is far too small to enable truly robust results from local consultations.
- 2.7 Approval has now been granted by Corporate Leadership Team to proceed with the development of an enlarged Citizens Panel. **Appendix 1** sets out the recent progress in the development and management of the Citizens' Panel. With its planned expansion of membership to 6000, an opportunity now exists to undertake a range of thematic consultations at the Area Committee level which will aid in the delivery of a range of locality working initiatives.

### **3.0 Main issues**

- 3.1 The council carries out a great deal of community engagement work aimed at increasing the involvement of local people in decision making. The Annual Statement on community engagement was submitted to the Corporate Governance and Audit Committee on June 15 2011 and they concluded that much good consultation work took place. However they also said that it was inconsistent and that there is a lack of coordination across the council.
- 3.2 Historically council services have run separate large-scale single issue surveys that are mailed to significant numbers of residents. The financial problems we face make it vitally important that we consult far more efficiently in the future.
- 3.3 Local partners are placing increased emphasis on the need to understand and work with residents and service users. Many face reduced engagement budgets which mean they need new, more cost effective ways to consult.
- 3.4 To show the scale of savings possible through better management of consultation, in 2010 the corporate consultation manager worked with the Strategic Landlord and the ALMOs to reduce the number of Tenant Surveys in the city from five to one. This saved £60K overall.

### **A new enhanced Citizens' Panel**

- 3.5 A Panel of at least 6000 adult residents, recruited to be representative of the ten Area Committee population profiles and therefore the city, will allow robust consultation at Area Committee and city levels, as well as for particular demographic groups or service-users.
- 3.6 A well-managed Citizens' Panel offers benefits including
- The ability to continue to understand the needs and views of communities at reduced cost
  - A catalyst for joined-up consultation planning and activity in Leeds
  - A significant contribution to the council values of 'working with communities' and 'spending money wisely'

- The ability to engage with a robust and representative cross-section of the city at smaller geographies
- The achievement of Locality Work objectives by enabling residents to engage in local decision making.

3.7 Consulting the Panel through surveys, focus groups and other methods will be significantly cheaper than equivalent methods we currently use. A high proportion of panel members will take part in online consultation to keep costs low.

### **Use and Management of the new Citizens' Panel**

3.8 The Panel will be used by partners, services and corporately as well as by area teams in support of Area Committee's community engagement objectives. There will be a vetting/clearance process before users consult the panel and a calendar of activity will be created. This will be managed by the corporate consultation manager working through the corporate consultation group.

3.9 The Panel will be consulted online as far as possible, using the Talking Point survey platform. Postal surveys will also be used where necessary to avoid limiting participation of different communities.

3.10 In order that deeper insight can be gained from consultation, where appropriate, users will be encouraged to go beyond just capturing perception responses through surveys by using methods such as focus groups, workshops and interviewing panel members.

### **Resources for panel recruitment and management**

3.11 Recruiting and managing the Panel ready for consultations in Year One is covered by existing PPI budgets.

3.12 NHS Leeds has confirmed it will provide £12.5k towards set up costs. Other partners have committed to providing resources in kind to support recruitment.

3.13 It is currently planned that the long term costs for maintaining membership and managing the use of the Citizens Panel will be covered by existing PPI budgets.

### **Costs for undertaking consultation through the Panel**

3.14 Services will not be charged for the costs of building and maintaining the Panel. Online aspects of survey research would also be free as the existing Talking Point system would be used. However, services will need to pay for the following elements of survey work:

- Postal survey production, mailing and Freepost return
- Data capture of postal survey returns
- Analysis and reporting

There will also be costs when delivering focus groups, workshops or other face to face consultations with the panel, such as venue hire, covering travel costs of those attending and refreshments. If impartial moderation is important, we may

decide to use one of our preferred market research suppliers, or a partner's staff. In these cases additional costs would apply.

- 3.15 The proposal for Area Committees use of the Citizens' Panel involves the use of data from a citywide survey at the Area Committee level. This means that there will be no additional cost to Area Committees for the production of the survey and analysis. Although an Input of staff time from Area teams will be required to draw local conclusions from this data. Should Area Committee's wish to undertake additional consultation through the Citizens' Panel the costs outlined in section 3.14 would apply.

### **Savings achieved through use of Citizen's Panel**

- 3.16 Discussion with services shows that significant savings can be made by consulting the Panel rather than many current approaches to consultation. For example;
- Residents Survey 2009 cost £64K, delivered face to face by interviewers. The equivalent done through the Panel, assuming 66% of responses are online, will cost an estimated £8.7K to provide delivery, analysis and reporting.
  - The Parks and Countryside Survey has been delivered in-house as a major postal exercise. Excluding officer time costs, c£25K was spent on delivery. The service is confident that a similar enough outcome would be gained from a Panel survey in future at lower cost.

A total of £80,000 can be saved for just these two exercises if managed through the Panel. The more consultation work that is suitable to be undertaken through the proposed Panel the greater the efficiency benefit.

- 3.17 The Panel would also make it feasible to introduce new consultation work that is otherwise unaffordable. For example, plans for a dedicated Health and Wellbeing survey to support the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment (JSNA) hinge on finding an affordable method for consultation and a new Panel is seen as critical to its success.

### **Creating a calendar of Panel consultation**

- 3.18 Panels give the greatest benefit when consultation is managed from a single agreed calendar of activity. There is a risk that if too little or too much consultation is put to the panel, or outside of an agreed cycle, response rates will fall and panel members will leave.
- 3.19 A number of consultations have already been identified for a calendar of Panel consultation. These include a number of council Business Plan perception-based performance indicators.
- 3.20 The corporate consultation group, and the Strategic Involvement Group, are continuing to draft a calendar of potential consultation for the Panel, aiming to thematically group individual requirements into larger consultations e.g. 'crime and grime', health and well being. If practical, these themes could align to the strategic partnership boards.

- 3.21 A registration of interest has already been received by Area Management for the use of the Leeds Citizens Panel to support Area Committee business planning and priority setting activity. Should Area Committees' agree to take up the opportunity of consulting the panel, a place will be set on the calendar and Area teams will work with corporate consultation to draft a detailed proposal for Area Committees to consider.

### **The Citizens Panel use at the Area Committee Level**

- 3.22 Area Committees have a responsibility for community engagement delegated by Executive Board as follows:

*Each Committee will agree a local community engagement plan based on an agreed template to ensure consistency across the city. Information on how Area Committees have delivered on their community engagement plans, will be included in an annual report to the Executive Board, which outlines achievements from the previous year to deliver the Area Delivery Plan, and future priorities.*

*2011/12 Function Schedule,*

*Council's Constitution (Part 3, section 3c)*

- 3.23 A range consultation methods have been developed by individual Area Committees to support the development of Area Delivery plans and the business of the Area Committee. Much of this activity represents good practice and work should be undertaken to capture this learning and seek to apply it to other Area Committees where appropriate.
- 3.24 While there is a recognition that a variety of approaches to engagement at the Area Committee level will continue to be necessary to respond to local issues, a degree of consistency across the city as a whole is needed to help maximise the impact of integrated locality working and achieve the level of co-ordination as set out in the Council's constitution.
- 3.25 To help achieve this balance of improved consistency while maintaining a flexible and responsive approach to engagement, it is suggested that Area Committees develop community engagement plans that works at two distinct levels:
- Primary Engagement: A core programme of primary engagement for all 10 Area Committees should be implemented which provides a consistent approach for consulting the public on the broad priorities for each area and meets the requirements for the area committees' delegated function. It is proposed that this is undertaken through annual surveys of Citizens Panel and is implemented as part of the annual Business Plan development and review process. The results of this consultation activity would be presented in an annual report specific to each Area Committee, setting out the findings of the consultation against the business plan themes.
  - Secondary Engagement: The findings from the Citizens' Panel consultation will provide a clear view of resident priorities and can be used to inform the development of a wider programme of engagement specific to each Area

Committee. For example, if the citizens panel consultation identified that a large proportion of residents living in a particular area were dissatisfied with the cleanliness of their neighbourhood and the quality of public greenspaces, then the Area Committee may choose to explore these issues in more detail through additional surveys and public meetings to help identify what changes in service delivery were required to address resident priorities. In this way the Citizens Panel would add value to existing programmes of consultation.

- 3.26 With a total membership of 6000, the Leeds Citizens' Panel will enable each of the ten Area Committees to consult approximately 600 residents who will represent the broad demographic make up of the area. In statistical terms this provides a robust sample size to undertake a broad range of engagement activities and enables the results of surveys to be analysed at the Area Committee level.
- 3.27 A number of thematic surveys are currently being considered which will produce data that can be used to measure the delivery of actions which might be contained in the Area Business Plans. Further consultation will be undertaken with elected members to determine how best to apply this approach to business plan performance monitoring. However, by undertaking Citizens Panel surveys each year we will be able to measure a wide range of Area Committee level trends such as:
- The percentage of people who feel safe walking alone in their neighbourhood after dark.
  - Levels of satisfaction relating cleanliness and environmental quality
  - The issues which limits residents from accessing local health services
  - Priorities for improvement to police and council services
- 3.28 In addition to community engagement, Area Committees have a delegated responsibility for Wellbeing funding. Area Committees are provided with a budget of capital and revenue funds each year which can be used to enhance local services or commission new initiatives from the council and external partners including the voluntary sector.
- 3.29 Consultation through the Citizens Panel will help identify the funding priorities for each of the 10 Area Committees thereby insuring that this limited resources is targeted at the areas where it is needed most. Further consultation will be undertaken with elected members to determine how best to apply this approach to Wellbeing fund prioritisation.

## **4.0 Corporate Considerations**

### **4.1 Consultation and Engagement**

The Leeds Citizens' Panel will form a central part of the council's community engagement strategy and represents a significant opportunity to better understand the needs and views of communities.

### **4.2 Equality and Diversity / Cohesion and Integration**

There are no specific equality considerations arising from this report. As such it has not been necessary to prepare an Equality Impact Assessment.

### **4.3 Council Policies and City Priorities**

A number of perception-based Business Plan and City Priority Plan performance indicators are likely to be measured through the Panel

The Panel will require the application of a greater degree of advance planning and quality control to the council's consultation work than currently exists.

### **4.4 Resources and Value for Money**

The expansion of the citizens' panel offers exceptional value for money. It will be delivered from existing budgets, and will cost less overall than surveys it aims to replace, such as the Residents Survey.

The Panel database will need to be managed by a dedicated officer.

Suitably skilled officers are required for data capture, analysis and report creation for the Panel consultations.

Services will need to fund any consultation they put to the panel, although usually at a significantly lower cost than for non-panel consultation.

If applied consistently, the Citizens' Panel offers significant efficiencies for consultation in support of Area Committee business planning and priority setting for Wellbeing.

#### **Legal Implications, Access to Information and Call In**

Data Protection law will apply to the management of the panel membership database, including data sharing between partner organisations

The enhanced Citizens' Panel will enable the council to 'consult a balanced selection' of residents as required by Section 138 of the Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Act 2007

### **4.5 Risk Management**

Panels give the greatest benefit when managed as a single project, from a single agreed calendar of activity. There is a risk that if too little or too much consultation is put to the panel, or outside of an agreed cycle, panel members leave.

There is a risk that services may not plan a calendar of engagement far enough ahead to identify activity for the Panel.

Panels must be refreshed, i.e. members retired and replaced, to stay representative. This level of management requires an ongoing contribution of resource.

In house delivery of a programme of consultation requires sound data processing and analytical resources. Failure to arrange this in support of the panel is a key risk to efficiency and data quality.



## **5.0 Conclusions**

- 5.2 There is a need to improve the coordination and consistency of consultation in Leeds, and to do so as efficiently as possible. The Leeds Citizens' Panel is a key part of how we aim to address this challenge.
- 5.3 A well-managed Citizens' Panel offers benefits including
- The ability to continue to understand the needs and views of communities at reduced cost
  - A catalyst for joined-up consultation planning and activity in Leeds
  - A significant contribution to the council values of 'working with communities' and 'spending money wisely'
  - The ability to engage robust and representative cross-section of the city at smaller geographies
  - Significant contribution to evidence for the involvement aspects of the Equality Act 2010
- 5.4 Consulting the Panel through surveys, focus groups and other methods will be significantly cheaper than equivalent methods we currently use.
- 5.5 With the expansion of Citizens' Panel an opportunity now exists to undertake a range of thematic consultations at the Area Committee level which will support the development of Area Business Plans, the identification of Wellbeing fund priorities and delivery of a range of locality working initiatives.
- 5.6 The inclusion of Citizens' Panel consultation as a core part of the Area Committees' community engagement activity will provide significant efficiencies and offer a consistent approach to consultation in support the delivery of functions delegated by Executive Board.
- 5.7 Due to the demographic representation of the Citizens' Panel an opportunity exists to gain the views of a much broader section of the community than would be achievable through the more conventional methods of engagement.
- 5.8 The use of the Citizens Panel at the Area Committee level would add value to existing engagement activity and strengthen our approach to involving local people in decision making.

## **6.0 Recommendations**

The Outer East Area Committee is asked to:

- Note and comment on the development of a new Citizen's Panel in Leeds as described in this paper

- Support the use of the new Leeds Citizens' Panel and to take up its use as part of the committee's community engagement activities in support of Wellbeing fund priority setting and in the development of the Area Business Plans.

### **Background documents**

- December 2010, Report to Executive Board, Toward Integrated Locality Working
- July 2011 Report to Corporate Leadership Team, A New Citizens Panel for Leeds
- 13 September 2011 Business Plan Report to Outer East Area Committee
- Appendix 1: Leeds Citizens' Panel progress update, October 27<sup>th</sup> 2011

**Leeds Citizens' Panel progress update, October 27<sup>th</sup> 2011.**

This note sets out the progress made on recruiting the new Leeds Citizens' Panel.

The main recruitment effort started at the beginning of October 2011, following a period of project design, process and resource management and liaison with partners. The initial focus has been on no/low-cost, pre-existing contact lists and communications channels.

We now have in place:

- Demographic profile of the 'ideal' panel for Leeds via Business Transformation
- Electronic systems to help us track the demography of respondents (via BT again)
- Webpage / information on council, PCT and other local websites via Comms Team
- Online and paper recruitment forms
- FAQ sheet, flyers and posters via Graphics Team
- Scanning systems to electronically capture paper responses via Adult Social Care

We are promoting the recruitment through:

- Social media incl. Twitter, Facebook
- Traditional media and PR incl. YEP, local radio
- About Leeds, Leeds card magazine and other public sector publications
- Private sector employer corporate social responsibility schemes via Leeds Ahead
- Attendance at community groups/events e.g. Carnival, Xmas lights switch-on.
- In public buildings e.g. libraries, One Stop Centres, GPs, attractions
- Emails to existing databases of residents / service users

The table below shows a selection of the organisations disseminating the recruitment message, for free:

| <b>Organisation</b>  | <b>Method</b>         | <b>Potential audience</b>  |
|----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|
| Leeds Rhinos         | Email                 | 16,000                     |
| Leeds City College   | Variety of methods    | 55,000 students            |
| Leeds Metropolitan   | Websites              | 30,500 students and staff  |
| University of Leeds  | Websites              | 40,000 students and staff  |
| Leeds College of Art | Email                 | 2000 students              |
| All 268 schools      | Newsletter to parents | Families of 110,000 pupils |

|                       |                          |            |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|------------|
| Leedscard             | Newsletter and email     | 60,000     |
| Concord interfaith    | Email and event          | 200 people |
| Current panel members | Email and post           | 800        |
| ALMOs                 | Websites and newsletters | 56,500     |
| LINK                  | Email                    | 500        |
| Benefits service      | Email                    | 3600       |
| NHS Foundation Trust  | Email                    | 14,000     |

Although there will be duplications in these lists, we estimate the invitation to join will initially reach c200,000 people. About Leeds will then reach [potentially] all households, reinforcing the message.

### Costs

To date we have spent c£1000, excluding officer time, largely on print. Although we expect these costs to increase, it should still be well within the available budget for the recruitment of the panel.

### Next steps

Tracking responses (c450 to date)

Establishing calendar of consultations for new Panel (request form circulated to all partners and services)

Further publicity preparation e.g. About Leeds story from November 14<sup>th</sup>

Arranging volunteers for face to face recruitment in bus station and other high-use areas e.g. Merrion Centre